

**MINUTES  
TRANSPORTATION AND CIRCULATION COMMISSION/  
BOARD OF PARKING PLACE COMMISSION SPECIAL MEETING  
MONDAY, JULY 23, 2018, 6:00 P.M.  
CITY COUNCIL CHAMBERS – CITY HALL**

**COMMISSIONERS PRESENT:**

Darren Jones, Chair  
Ken Bane, Vice-Chair  
Matthew Atwong  
Peter Gambino  
Amy Koorstad  
Moramay Sanchez

**COMMISSIONERS ABSENT:**

Elizabeth Hansburg

**STAFF PRESENT:**

Mark Miller – Traffic Engineer  
Dave Langstaff – Traffic Engineering Analyst  
Ted White – Director of Community Development  
Heather Allen – Consultant Planner  
Rhonda Cleggett – Traffic Lieutenant  
Deina Dailey - Parking Control Officer  
Paul Dominguez – Engineering Aide

The meeting was called to order by Chairperson Darren Jones at 6:02 pm.

**PUBLIC COMMENTS**

None.

**REGULAR BUSINESS**

**ITEM NO. 1**

**DOWNTOWN PARKING PROGRAMS**

Director Ted White introduced the item to consider changes to the employee permit parking program and the creation of a nighttime paid parking pilot program in Downtown Fullerton. Mr. White indicated the proposed changes are one part of a larger program, The Downtown Fullerton Game Plan, to improve the downtown including updating restaurant and bar regulations; and active partnership with the downtown stake holders.

Mr. White noted that there was paid parking previously in place the downtown until 1986 when parking meters were removed. He said that there are over 4,000 parking spaces in the downtown city parking lots and parking structures and an additional 1,600 on-street parking spaces. The goal is to maximize the use of the spaces and generate an ongoing funding source

to maintain and create a welcoming environment for businesses. The goal of the program is to increase turnover in public parking areas for customers, better manage employee parking, manage peak parking demands and establish revenue streams for downtown operations.

The Employee Permit Parking Program (E.P.P.P.) allows businesses in the downtown to purchase annual permits, at a cost of \$6.00 each, to allow their employees to park in yellow marked parking stalls and supersede the posted time restricted parking limits. Mr. White indicated that there are currently 720 yellow striped parking stalls in the downtown public parking lots and structures. He indicated that the permit fee is well below the market rate. The recommendation would relocate 189 designated employee parking spaces from four centrally located parking lots to the outer perimeter lots to free up parking in those high demand lots for customers. Mr. White indicated there would be a limited amount of employee parking spaces left in the central parking lots, approximately 40 spaces.

The second recommendation would increase the fee for the employee parking permits from \$6.00 per year to \$40.00 in 2019, \$80 in 2020, and \$120 in 2021. The original recommendation was to increase the fee to \$120.00 in 2019 and after public feedback a phased approach was recommended.

Mr. White introduced the Nighttime Paid Parking Program (N.P.P.P.) 90-day pilot program. It attempts to address the burdens on city resources from the late night bar crowds and restaurant operators on city infrastructure. After community feedback the suggested locations for the pilot program is bordered by Wilshire Avenue on the north, the railroad tracks on the south, Malden Avenue on the west, and Pomona Avenue on the east. The pilot program would charge a \$5.00 flat fee for parking on Thursday, Friday, and Saturday nights from 8:00pm until 1:00am within the established area. The estimated gross revenue is \$221,000.00, not including expenses. The purpose of this pilot program is for data gathering before bringing the item back for a permanent paid parking program.

Mr. White also noted the recommendation is to revise posted time restricted parking in the downtown to 7:00am to 7:00pm, however there would be no changes to the 2- or 3-hour parking limits. He indicated that inconsistent time restricted parking hours are confusing and make it difficult to enforce in the downtown.

Mr. White noted a concern from the public was parking enforcement. The Police Department is currently funded for six Parking Control Officers but only three PCOs are on staff. The Police Department is currently in the recruitment process to fill the three vacant PCO positions with the intention for increased enforcement in the downtown, with current personnel, until the new PCOs are hired and trained.

The new revenue streams would be designated for downtown operations; including maintenance, enforcement, safety and security, accessibility, beautification, landscaping and customer experience. Future feedback from the steak holders would also help determine how the revenue is spent.

Community outreach consisted a community meeting on May 21, 2018 and 10 meetings with various steak holders. Notices were mailed to property owners and businesses informing them of this hearing along with activating the Downtown Game Plan webpage of the City's website as well. Mr. White said staff will engage with the steak holders during the 90-day pilot program and monitor it for potential impacts to the surrounding residential neighborhoods, making changes along the way if necessary. Recommendations would go to City Council for approval and would return to the Board of Parking Place for ratification as they include Parking Districts 1 & 2.

Commissioner Ken Bane asked what criteria was used to identify the parking lots to relocate the employee parking spaces and if any negative impacts were identified. Mr. White responded that the lots were identified based on the 2016 parking study that was conducted by consultants Fehr & Peers. Mr. White indicated that the study shows that the northern lots would be able to accommodate the relocation of the employee parking stalls as they are currently underutilized. There is also a potential for a new parking structure in the area as well. Commissioner Bane asked if the proposed changes were requested by businesses in the downtown. Mr. White indicated that common complaints from the restaurants are the lack of convenient customer parking in the lunch time near the businesses and limited turnover. Commissioner Bane asked for clarification regarding costs for maintenance of the parking lots/structures and if the pilot program help cover these costs. Mr. White responded that the revenue generated would not be able to cover all the infrastructure and maintenance costs but would be able to assist more than the current funding available.

Commissioner Matt Atwong asked for the net revenue generated after costs to manage the proposed programs. Mr. White responded that bids from vendors would be required to obtain accurate cost information but the goal from the hearing is to seek policy direction and be able to move forward with the bid process. Commissioner Atwong asked why the downtown employees are the only segment that will shoulder the increased costs and Mr. White responded that the parking lots in the downtown are public lots and the city should not be subsidizing parking.

Commissioner Peter Gambino asked what the current costs are for the existing downtown employee parking program. Traffic Analyst Dave Langstaff responded that permits cost about \$1.50 to produce plus staff time to administer. Commissioner Gambino asked for clarification of the utilization charts. Principal Traffic Engineer Jason Pack with Fehr and Peers indicated that perception is that there is not enough parking in the downtown, however the parking utilization study indicated that, as a whole, the downtown area is at about 75% utilized, but the central parking lots are closer to 100% utilized. This indicates better parking management practices are necessary to create higher turnover in the high demand spots. Commissioner Gambino asked if there are concerns with negative impacts in the surrounding communities. Mr. Pack responded that there could be unintended consequences with parking in the adjacent neighborhoods and the city would need to monitor the pilot program and make changes if necessary. Mr. Gambino asked for estimated costs to implement the pilot program and Mr. Pack said it would vary for the nighttime paid parking program but he recommends the city set up a system with the parking management vendor that is depended on revenue collected to minimize exposure to the city. The revenue collected from the employee parking permit fees would go back directly to the city.

Commissioner Moramay Sanchez asked if the proposed kiosks would be automated or staffed and Mr. White responded that they would be staffed to reduce costs. Ms. Sanchez asked for clarification on the paid parking hours for the proposed lots. Mr. White said the cost would be a \$5.00 flat fee to park Thursdays, Fridays and Saturday nights from 8:00pm to 1:00am in the proposed parking lots.

Commissioner Amy Koorstad asked if there would be additional outreach and notification in the pilot program is approved and Mr. White responded in the affirmative.

## PUBLIC COMMENT

The following members of the public spoke with concerns regarding changes to the parking in the downtown, citing a need for a cost benefit analysis, lack of enforcement, increased fees, lack of current data, evening safety concerns, and changes for residents who live in the downtown:

- Christian Murcia at 216 N. Harbor Boulevard
- Mike Wallace at 237 Florence Place
- Warren Ernst at 214 N. Harbor Boulevard
- David Arnold at 216 N. Harbor Boulevard
- Jeff Fearn at 1122 Whitewater Drive
- Paul Berkman at 211 N. Pomona Avenue
- Jonathan Marzluf at 4206 W. Ash Avenue
- Leanne Le at 115 E. Commonwealth Avenue
- Karen Gaeta at 211 N. Pomona Avenue
- Dr. Jeff Garrett at 110 E. Wilshire Avenue
- Michael Hurst at 122 N. Harbor Boulevard
- Richard Lambros at 201 N. Harbor Boulevard
- Deanna Moore at 1075 S. Avocado Way
- Bruce Indermill at 115 E. Wilshire Avenue
- Cynthia Peck at 550 N. Harbor Boulevard
- Mike Olson at 117 W. Commonwealth Avenue
- Wendi Goldman at 420 ½ W. Commonwealth Avenue
- Donald Lawson at 310 N. Harbor Boulevard

The following members of the public spoke in support of changes to the downtown parking program citing a need for additional customer parking and maintenance needs:

- Mike Olson at 117 W. Commonwealth Avenue

Mr. White clarified that the surrounding downtown parking structures are not included in the proposed relocation of employee parking stalls nor the nighttime paid parking pilot program as some speakers indicated. Planner Heather Allen also clarified that paid parking would only apply after 8:00pm in the designated lots and there would be no fees in the other parking lots. She also clarified that parking permits most benefit those employees who work a 9:00am to 5:00pm or similar schedule as the time restrictions are generally posted for 8:00am to 6:00pm. Employees that work evening shifts beginning at 5:00pm would not need an employee parking permit to park for their entire shift.

Mr. White shared a letter from the North Orange County Chamber of Commerce in support of the proposed programs while requesting funding received from the program to be directed back into the downtown and support additional parking enforcement.

Commissioner Atwong has concerns with the parking fees and unknown net revenue for the proposed parking programs. Mr. White said he spoke with a parking vendor and initial estimates are costs would be approximately \$20,000.00 per month for the 90-day pilot parking program. He also indicated that the intent of the pilot program was to gather data and was not focused on generating revenue.

Commissioner Gambino is worried that the revenue generated would not be able to cover parking maintenance costs and create hardships to the business owners. He would support a smaller increase to the employee parking permit fees, enough to cover program costs.

Chairperson Jones noted the unique characteristics of the downtown and is interested in hearing more about creating a business improvement district for the downtown that a member of the public mentioned. Mr. White indicated that the city has discussed a business improvement district for the downtown over the years but no action has been taken. Mr. White would like to see the city take action and move forward by implementing these pilot programs noting that creating a perfect parking program would make it difficult getting to a decision. Chairperson Jones asked for costs related to updating the time frames on the parking signs and Mr. White responded that it would be low cost, as the signs would not be replaced with an overlay added to update the hours. Chairperson Jones is supportive of a pilot paid parking program in order to obtain data and learn what works and what does not. He would like some flexibility in case there are negative impacts to the businesses and surrounding neighborhoods.

Commissioner Bane's concerns related to the relocation of the employee parking spaces and the 2016 parking survey as includes data that may not be current any longer. He also would like to see the proposed costs to the employee parking permits reduced and would like to see fees attached to the evening businesses whose customers most impact the downtown. Commissioner Bane would support raising the paid parking fee from \$5.00 and possibility starting the paid hours to later in the evening. He would support standardizing the time restricted parking hours as well. Mr. White responded that a new parking study would be costly to produce and may result in very similar data. It was suggested that Parking Control Officers may be able to assist with collecting new data and Parking Control Officer Dena Daily indicated that they are understaffed and would take away from their regular parking enforcement duties.

Commissioner Sanchez would also support a later start time for the paid parking and raise the parking fees to \$10.00. She would be open to extending the pilot program longer than the proposed 90-days as there are different dynamics in the downtown at different times of the year. Mr. White is open to extending the pilot program time frame, modifying the pricing and make the hours flexible as well.

Chairperson Jones MOTIONED to CONTINUE item #1 and have staff provide more information regarding the proposed parking programs, SECONDED by Commissioner Koorstad. Motion Carries 4-2. Commissioners Atwong and Bane no.

Chairperson Jones MOTIONED to CONTINUE item #2 increasing the fee for Employee Permits from \$6.00 per year, and would like to see a price that limits it to a cost recovery program and modernizes the existing program, SECONDED by Commissioner Gambino. Motion carries 6-0

Chairperson Jones MOTIONED to APPROVE and recommend item #3 as is, SECONDED by Commissioner Gambino. Koorstad, Motion carries 5-1. Commissioner Gambino no.

Chairperson Bane MOTIONED to APPROVE and recommend item #4 establishing days, times, and pricing for a paid parking pilot program on Thursday, Friday and Saturday nights within an established area to include flexible pricing and hours for the duration of the program and collect data and feedback from the steak holders, SECONDED by Commissioner Koorstad. Motion APPROVED 5-1. Commissioner Gambino no.

Chairperson Bane MOTIONED to APPROVE and recommend item #5 as proposed, SECONDED by Chairperson Jones. Motion carries 5-1. Commissioner Atwong no.

Mr. White indicated that the items the Commission recommended will go to Council for approval on August 21, 2018.

### **ADJOURNMENT**

Chairperson Hansburg adjourned the Transportation and Circulation Commission 9:10 pm.