



Agenda Report

Fullerton City Council

MEETING DATE: NOVEMBER 19, 2019

TO: CITY COUNCIL / SUCCESSOR AGENCY

SUBMITTED BY: KENNETH A. DOMER, CITY MANAGER

PREPARED BY: MATT FOULKES, COMMUNITY AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT DIRECTOR

SUBJECT: DOWNTOWN PARKING – NIGHTTIME PAID PARKING PILOT PROGRAM UPDATE

SUMMARY

On April 16, 2019, the City Council authorized the City Manager to execute a Professional Services Agreement with SP+ for parking management services and established the Downtown nighttime paid parking pilot program for a period of up to 180 days (24 weeks) with interim reporting to the City Council after 90 days (12 weeks). This item provides a progress report following the first 90-days of the pilot program and seeks authorization for certain next steps. Additionally, staff is working with SP+ on options for nighttime paid parking operations following the conclusion of the pilot program on the last weekend of December and will provide recommendations to the City Council on December 17, 2019 for its consideration.

RECOMMENDATION

1. Receive and file progress report.
2. Authorize the preparation of a scope of services and cost proposal from SP+ for the development and implementation of a parking program for daytime long-term parkers to replace the existing employee permit parking program and return to the City Council for program consideration.

PRIORITY POLICY STATEMENTS

This item matches the following Priority Policy Statements:

- Fiscal and Organizational Stability
- Public Safety
- Infrastructure and City Assets.

FISCAL IMPACT

No impact from this action. Based on the limited scope of the pilot program, it is currently cost / revenue neutral to the City after incorporating revenue received from parking citations for failure to pay as part of the pilot program. A comprehensive analysis of the costs and revenues from the pilot program will be provided as part of the report at the conclusion of the pilot program.

DISCUSSION

The pilot program launched on July 18, 2019 with three short-term goals, all three of which are currently being accomplished:

Goal #1: Collect data regarding parking behaviors and impacts to businesses and surrounding residential neighborhoods

Goal #2: Demonstrate potential revenue source for reinvestment in Downtown

Goal #3: Evaluate feasibility of more permanent paid parking program on City-owned parking assets

Over the course of 14 weeks, 12,700 payments were made for parking in Downtown Fullerton between the kiosks (88%) and the ParkMobile app (12%).

The following provides a progress report and summarizes some of the data collected through October 20, 2019.

Paid Parking Spaces: Paid parking is located in eleven areas including nine surface lots and two parking structures (labeled A-1 through D-2 in Figure 1 below).

Figure 1 – Paid Parking Locations



Collectively, these parking lots / structures total 1,907 parking spaces that are part of the pilot program. The number of parking spaces within each location is detailed in the table below (Figure 2).

Figure 2 – Spaces by Location

Location	Number of parking spaces
A1	129
A2	101
B1 (Wilshire Structure)	324
B2	44
B3	170
C1	104
C2	42
C3	43
C4	93
D1 (SOCO Structure)	816
D2	41
Total	1,907

When sorted by total usage during the Pilot Program hours (9:00pm to 1:00am), the parking locations consistently fell into one of three tiers (Figure 3) with the rank within the tier varying by day of the week for some lots. Regardless of night of the week, the SOCO structure always ranked highest in usage. This outcome was expected given the large total number of parking spaces available in this lot compared to the others and the relative newness of the structure.

Figure 3 – Location Ranking

Rank	Thursday	Friday	Saturday
1	D1 (SOCO)	D1(SOCO)	D1(SOCO)
2	C1	A1	A1
3	A1	A2	C1
4	A2	B3	B3
5	B3	C1	A2
6	B1 (Wilshire)	B1 (Wilshire)	B1 (Wilshire)
7	D2	C4	B2
8	B2	B2	C4
9	C4	D2	D2
10	C3	C2	C2
11	C2	C3	C3

Pre-9:00pm parking counts: SP+ inventoried vehicles already parked in each of the pilot program lots at 9:00pm to compile a list of vehicles on which payment is not required. In so doing, a count of cars parked prior to 9:00pm has been obtained. Figure 4 shows

the average total pre-9:00pm counts in the eleven pilot program locations by day of the week along with what percentage of the total 1,907 program spaces this amount represents.

Figure 4 – Pre-9:00pm Parking Counts

	Thursday	% of total program spaces	Friday	% of total program spaces	Saturday	% of total program spaces
Total cars already parked prior to 9:00pm	867	45%	1,146	60%	1,114	58%

Figure 5 shows the same pre-9:00pm count data in terms of utilization (the percentage of spaces already occupied by a car at or before 9:00pm) by lot along with the number of available spaces in the lot. For the most desirable surface lots (C1, A1, A2, D-2) the number of spaces available for new parkers when the program started at 9:00pm was in some cases only a few parking spaces.

Figure 5 – Pre-9:00pm Utilization

Rank	Thursday	# of available spaces @ 9:00pm	Friday	# of available spaces @ 9:00pm	Saturday	# of available spaces @ 9:00pm
1	C1 - 87%	14	C1 - 94%	6	D2 - 96%	2
2	A2 - 84%	17	A2 - 92%	8	A2 - 96%	4
3	D2 - 81%	8	A1 - 86%	18	C1 - 90%	10
4	A1 - 69%	40	D2 - 86%	6	A1 - 86%	18
5	C4 - 69%	29	C4 - 85%	14	C4 - 85%	14
6	B2 - 61%	17	B3 - 80%	34	B3 - 71%	49
7	B3 - 57%	73	C2 - 76%	10	C2 - 70%	13
8	C2 - 44%	24	B2 - 76%	11	B2 - 67%	15
9	D1 - 35%	530	C3 - 63%	16	C3 - 56%	19
10	C3 - 29%	31	D1 - 50%	408	D1 - 51%	400
11	B1 - 21%	256	B1 - 30%	227	B1 - 22%	253

Employee / Daytime Long-Term Parking: The pre-9:00pm parkers are a mix of patrons and employees. SP+ staff performed several manual counts of employee permit parking placards and verified the use of these locations by employees. While the counts were lower than expected based on estimates of the number of employees parking permits issued, there was also no reason why an employee would need to be displaying a placard after 6:00pm which is a likely factor in the low count of employee hangtags. Through its

current Employee Parking Program, the City issues employee parking permits to Downtown businesses at a cost of \$6 per year. These permits allow vehicle to park in a yellow-striped stall within a time-restricted lot / structure for longer than the posted time limit. Currently, the time-limited parking restrictions for these lots ends at 6:00pm.

The parking counts from SP+ which found such a high percentage of cars that are already in the most desirable lots pre-9:00pm, along with the fairly low turnover of vehicles in those lots during the course of the evening further supports the need to develop a better program for employees and other long-term parkers so they are not competing for spaces that would better serve the adjacent retail, restaurant and service businesses if they had a higher rate of turn over. Anecdotal information provided by several businesses whose customers primarily rely on parking within the Amerige Parking lots (A1 and A2) have indicated that the inability to find spaces in these lots directly impacts their daytime business when customers who are unable to find parking ultimately elect to go somewhere else to eat or shop.

In 2016, Fehr and Peers assisted the City with the preparation of an Existing Conditions Report on the state of Downtown Fullerton parking. The Report was the first phase in a larger effort to improve management of the City's public parking supply. In 2018 they were tasked with proposing specific actions for implementation related to two separate but related programs, the employee permit parking program, and paid parking for evening patrons. Action on initial recommendations made by Fehr and Peers on the employee permit parking program was tabled by the Transportation and Circulation Commission in July 2018, while the nighttime paid parking portion was approved to move forward for City Council consideration.

Based on the feedback from employees and businesses provided at that time and the information gained during the pilot program, staff is recommending restarting the efforts to revise the existing daytime employee permit parking program to address the provision of adequate, convenient and safe parking for Downtown employees and other individuals with long-term (more than 2 or 3 hours) needs. Additionally, it is important to recognize that Fullerton supports a variety of businesses with employees beyond a traditional 9:00am–5:00pm workday.

Post-9:00pm: The pilot program pertains to new parkers after 9:00pm. Payment reporting provides a count of those cars that have paid to park. Figure 6 shows the average total post-9:00pm counts in the eleven pilot program locations by day of the week and the average parking revenue received. The second part of the table compares these parking/revenue actuals with the projected figures that SP+ provided prior to the start of the program.

Figure 6 – Post-9:00pm Parking Counts

	Thursday	Friday	Saturday	Total per week
Avg. new parkers after 9:00pm	158	361	388	907
Avg. Paid Parking Revenue @ \$5 per car	\$790	\$1,805	\$1,940	\$4,535

SP+ Estimates based on preliminary count data	1,425 new parkers after 9:00pm	\$7,125
---	--------------------------------	----------------

A number of factors could be contributing to this discrepancy between the projected number of new parkers and actuals including: an increase of shared-ride vehicle trips, an increase in customers coming to the Downtown before 9:00pm to take advantage of the increasing variety of new restaurants and/or the dates or time of the year when SP+ took its preliminary counts were not representative of actual parking behavior over a longer period.

Data Collection and Monitoring: In addition to the payment reporting, counts were conducted during the pilot program at week 0 (baseline), week 4 (2nd week after transition from warnings to citations) and week 12 (half-way) to evaluate the pilot program to identify any unintended consequences. Below are the findings for each area surveyed.

a. Free Parking Lots: Free parking is provided east of Pomona Avenue and north of Chapman Avenue in a combination of five surface lots and two parking structures (Pomona and Plummer). The free parking at a slightly farther but reasonable walking distance provides an option for those wishing to avoid payment. Some notable observations from the parking count data in these lots/structures include:

- There has not been a significant increase in the number of vehicles utilizing these free lots during the program. One conclusion that can be drawn from this is that the parking rate (\$5 flat rate) was not expensive enough to change the parking behaviors for the vast majority of parkers coming to Downtown.
- The pilot program is likely drawing more cars to the Pomona structure and surface lot on the southeast corner of Santa Fe and Pomona Avenues, generally the closest free locations. It is unknown, however, if the increases are due to a lack of vacant paid parking spaces or if customers (and employees arriving after 9:00pm) are opting to park in these lots to avoid having to pay for parking.

b. Residential Streets: There are several predominantly residential blocks abutting the pilot program (Whiting between Harbor and Highland, Wilshire between Malden and Highland and Pomona and Lemon, Amerige between Pomona and Lemon, Pomona between Amerige and Whiting and Walnut and Truslow between Harbor and Highland) that have on-street parking. A review of the parking count data on these streets indicated that while this parking is used, there was not marked increase in the total parking that could be attributable to the pilot program.

c. City Hall Lots: The lots on the north and south side of Amerige Avenue, west of Malden Avenue are underutilized when City Hall is closed. The employee lot on the north side of Amerige showed a slight increase on Friday and Saturday nights. This lot was not specifically identified on the Fullerton Parking Guide website as an available ‘free’ lot, so it is not clear what factors contributed to this finding.

d. Warnings and Citations: FMC 8.48.060 was established in advance of the pilot program to provide local regulations and a corresponding fee associated with the failure to pay for parking. During week 1 and week 2 of the pilot program, the SP+

enforcement staff provided warnings and informational flyers to 118 cars that did not pay as required. Citations for failing to pay commenced in week 3. SP+ enforcement staff is able to interface directly with the City's citation vendor, Turbo Data, providing a seamless integration into the existing citation process. Through week 14, 1,397 citations have been issued of which 141 (10%) have been appealed. Of the 141 appeals, 65% were denied (citation upheld), 13% were approved (citation dismissed), and 22% are still pending further review and decision according to Turbo Data. The City receives \$40.86 of each paid citation after \$11 is paid to State and County fees and \$1.14 to Turbo Data for processing.

Inquiries and Feedback: Prior to the commencement of the pilot program, the City launched <https://fullerton.parkingguide.com>. In addition to information about the program, the website provides a Frequently Ask Question (FAQ) and a Contact Us section. The City mailed and emailed the Downtown stakeholders and used the City homepage, Fullerton Observer and "coming soon" parking lot signage to spread the word on the program in advance of its launch. All material directed people to the website for additional information and provided a staff contact for inquiries. City staff also accompanied SP+ during the first week of the program to observe the process and field any questions from Downtown patrons and/or employees.

To date, the majority of questions/concerns expressed to staff have been related to employee and transit user parking. In nearly all cases, once the person was informed that parkers arriving prior to the start of the program (9:00pm) are not subject to payment, they were satisfied. 72-hour parking is permitted in the SOCO structure on the top floor for Amtrak users and for commuters who store a car for use during the week. The FAQ section on the website has been periodically updated based on these common inquiries.

Two businesses raised concerns to the City about the program, both of which have been addressed as discussed below. A staff member from Branagan's Irish Pub was using the ParkMobile app and "bought" free parking prior to 9:00pm. The app does not prevent people from doing this nor is this a requirement of the pilot program. This type of transaction has no associated fee. At the start of the pilot program, if you "bought" a free parking session, it expired at 8:59pm when the paid portion of the program started. However, pursuant to the program, any car that is parked in the lot prior to 9:00pm is free to remain in the lot without charge. After this idiosyncrasy was brought to the City's attention, staff worked immediately with ParkMobile to modify the app to match the provisions of the pilot program. Now, any free parking "purchased" lasts until 2:00am when the parking facilities close. Similarly, while the pilot program ends at 1:00am, any paid parking purchased also lasts until 2:00am.

Fullerton staff was contacted by the Old Spaghetti Factory (OSF) regarding a provision in their lease with the City for free non-exclusive customer parking in their adjacent parking lot (Lot C-4). OSF's operating hours overlap with the pilot program by 30 minutes on Thursday nights and 60 minutes on Friday and Saturday nights. Staff worked with OSF to design signage for the lot (C-4) to accommodate customers in compliance with the lease and SP+/ParkMobile created a functionality in the ParkMobile app for use by OSF employees to register customer vehicles parking after 9:00pm to "validate" their parking when they enter the restaurant.

Attachments:

- Attachment 1 – PowerPoint Presentation